No.98/Safety I/3/Safety Shield **New Delhi, dated :16.09.1998**

Board in supersession of all the previous instructions on the subject, has decided to revise the criteria for assessment of the safety performance of a Railway for awarding Railway Minister Safety Shield.

2. The Railway Minister Safety Shield will now be awarded as per the following revised norms /criteria.

	Particulars	Break up of marks	Total marks allotted
I	Consequential Train accidents performance		90
	Collision	36	
	Derailment	18	
	Accidents at Level Xings		
	(i) Manned	18	
	(ii) Un manned	14	
	Fire in Train	04	
II	D & AR		30
	A – Inquiry	12	
	a) Non Prompt reporting + follow up for each case (-0.5)	3	
	b) Prima facie or fact finding not within D+10 days for each case (-0.5)	3	
	c) Accident Inquiry report not within D+30 days for each case (-0.5) Not within D+45 days for each case (-1.0)	6	
	B – D & AR	18	
	a) Disciplinary action not completed within 2 years for each case (-2). within 3 years for each case (-3). within 4 years for each case (-4).	9	
	b) Punishment not as per norms for each case (-0.5)	9	
III	Human element		10
IV	Implementation		20

a) Improvement in over due refresher, PME, Safety Camps, Inspection, w/o Brake van.	10 (2 each)	
b) Implementation of policy directives/ instructions issued by Railway Board.	5	
c)Publicity	5	
Total		**150**
V Discretionary*/ Unanticipated factors		10

*To be included initially till the system stabilizes.

3. In the above revised Marks, the accident performance contributes 60% marks which have been further apportioned for Collisions (40%), for Derailments (20%), for Manned Level Xing accidents (20%), for Un-manned level Xing accidents (15% approximately) and for fire in trains (5% approximately).

Amongst other factors, while the D&AR contributes 20% (8% for Inquiries and 12% for D&AR), Human element contributes 6.66% and Implementation 13.34%.

4. The Shield will be awarded on the performance in the preceding financial year (March to February) rather than the present practice of calendar year.

5. CONSEQUENTIAL TRAIN ACCIDENTS: (90 marks)

i) The marks for collisions, derailments, level crossing accidents and fire are broadly divided into 4 categories.

ii) For each category of accident the marks will be apportioned as:

A. Involvement of passenger train	30%
B. Involvement of goods train	20%
C. Casualty/ Injuries	20%
D. Improvement average over the last three years	30%

For each type of accident.

iii) In each case of passenger, goods train accident or casualty/ injury, the Railway which has performed best will be awarded maximum marks and worst Railway will be awarded 0 (Zero) marks and remaining railways will be calibrated on pro-rata basis.

iv) For passenger and goods train involved in accident, marks will be allotted on the basis of Accidents (Current Year) per passenger/ goods proportional mixed million train kms (preceding year).

v) For more than 5 casualty /10 grievous injury, railway will be penalized by (-1) mark for each 5 casualties /10 injuries or part thereof.

vi) Marks are apportioned on pro-rata basis for inter railway performance and improvements of average of last 3 years.

vii) Similarly Railway whose performance has deteriorated with respect to average of last 3 years will be awarded (0-15) marks on pro-rata basis. Railways, which have improved, will get between 15-30 marks. The best Railway will be allotted 30 marks and remaining on pro-rata basis.

viii) Level crossing accidents will be co-related with the incidences per million train kilometer/ level crossing. The assessment will be made separately for Manned & Un- manned level crossings.

6. D& AR (30 marks)

Assessment of finalization of 'Accident inquiries' will be based on percentage of inquires completed within the target of

a) Inquiries		Max Marks
i) Reporting	Prompt reporting of Accidents and follow up (-1/2) for each case.	- 3
ii) Prima facie	Cause or fact finding inquiry D+10 (-1/2) for each case	- 3
iii) Inquiry report	Exceeding D+30 (-1/2) for each case Exceeding D+45 (-1.0) for each case	- 6

b) D&AR

i) Time taken in finalization of disciplinary action 9

For each case > 1 year (-2) marks
For each case > 2 year (-3) marks
For each case > 3 year (-4) marks

ii) Punishment not as per norms prescribed by Railway Board 9

(-1/2) for each case.

These marks will be allotted based on Railways performance in terms of opening balance, fresh arising, clearance in present FY, closing balance.

7. HUMAN ELEMENT (10 marks)

10 marks are allotted for this item. Full marks will be allotted to a railway for limiting accidents due to failure of railway staff to 33%. With every increase in percentage, 0.2 marks will be deducted. The assessment will be made by using the formula:

10 – (S-33) x 0.2

'S' will be the percentage of accidents attributed to failure of railway staff during the year under assessment. For this purpose only consequential train accidents will be taken into account.

8. IMPROVEMENT IN OVERDUE REFRESHER ETC (10 marks)

10 marks (2 marks each) are allotted for performance of railway with regard to improvement in number of inspections, running of train without brake van, over-due refresher courses, PME, Safety Camp with respect to last year.

9. IMPLEMENTATION (10 marks)

10 marks (5 marks each) are allotted for performance of the Railway with regard to follow up of safety instructions/ policy directives issued and publicity.

10. DISCRETIONARY /UNANTICIPATED FACTORS (10 marks)

Initially a provision of 10 optional marks is also kept on discretion of safety directorate for any un-anticipated requirement till the system stabilizes.

11. Railways Minister's Safety Shield shall be awarded to a Railway which gets the highest marks subject to its not having any accident involving high casualties or poorer performance in terms of the number of train accidents and Accidents per million Train Kilometers than the preceding year.

12. Only those indices, which are either available with the Safety Directorate or proposed to be maintained, will be considered for adjudging performance of a Railway.

13. Hence, Railways will ensure submission of all relevant information to Board's office by every 7th of the following month. However, the information related to the month of February must reach Board's office by 7th March so that the assessment for Safety Shield may be made and put up to Minister by 25th March, positively.

14. Railway Minister Safety Shield for the year 1998-99 will be awarded on the basis of norms being circulated under this letter.